

Editing Department (Montage)

Final Thesis Evaluation

Author: **Natalia Posada Ruiz**

Title: **El Velador, The distance montage of a drug war**

Evaluation by the Opponent

Author of Evaluation (name, surname, department): **MgA. Tomáš Doruška, KSS / MONTAGE FAMU**

Evaluation of the content and resulting form of a theoretical Thesis:

Appropriate choice of Thesis objective and approach.....	A
Relative completeness of the literature search in relation to the topic	A
Ability to adopt a critical approach and use specialised literature sources	A
Logical structure of the Thesis, continuity and proportionality of chapters	B
Linguistic level and style	B
Compliance with the bibliography standards (no thesis may be recommended for defence if there are multiple quote sections indicating no source in the text).....	C
Sufficient extent of images, justification for and appropriateness of such images, graphic representation.....	A
Originality of the Thesis, contribution to the field of interest	B
Overall Evaluation of the Thesis (A-F)	B

(explanation: A = outstanding performance exceeding the criteria above, B = above-average performance with minimum errors, C = average performance with an acceptable level of error, D = acceptable performance with a higher level of error, E = performance merely satisfying the criteria, F = unacceptable performance)

Recommendations:

The individual verbal evaluation of the theoretical Thesis includes a paragraph summarising the contents and conclusions of the Thesis; presents a more detailed evaluation of the aforementioned criteria, particularly the justification for the D, E, F grades; points out the positive features of the Thesis, particularly if the grade is A, B; formulates the questions for the student to answer during the defence; in conclusion, the evaluation gives a clear statement on whether the author has demonstrated the ability to work creatively and independently in his/her chosen area of research or not, whether the Thesis meets the standard requirements for final theses or not, whether the Supervisor/Opponent recommends the Thesis for defence or not, and the proposed grade. Typically, the verbal evaluation takes 1 standard page; if there are no objections to the Thesis, it may be shorter. With theses where there is nothing to criticise, an additional question should be asked as to where the student should direct his/her subsequent research.

Individual verbal evaluation of the theoretical Thesis:

Natalia focused on theory invented by Artavazd Peleshyan and applied it to some selected examples of Latin-American documentary.

The student was inspired by the method when "the meaning of violence shines throughout the film but the director never shows a single frame of violence in itself". This initial moment helped Natalia to start studying the mechanism of how to work with indirect communication, repetition and the structuring and gradual dosage of information.

This structured text, enriched with diagrams and pictures from the mentioned movies are helping to express the assumption and lead to one of the surprising conclusion of Natalia, that: *Mrs. "Almada, without being conscious she was applying the same concepts Peleshyan developed years ago, managed to give a style to the film which is very different from Peleshyan's style, whilst keeping the essence of the editing itself."*

This master's thesis has the quality of a theoretical text which fulfils the condition to deliver a new perspective on the phenomenon of drug wars and it meets the standard requirements for final theses on extraordinary level.

I recommend this thesis for defence and propose the grade B.

Questions for the student to answer during the defence:

A) What are the connections of your practical work on graduation film in a way of telling a story about violence without showing violence – the principle you study in your theoretical diploma work? Are there any?

B) Can you shortly describe cylindrical structure and compare with circular structure in general – and later can you compare it using concrete example from Peleshyan's and Almada's films?

Date: September 12, 2022

Signature:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Tanner' followed by a surname, written in a cursive style.